

San Carlos Apache Tribe / White Mountain Apache Tribe Transportation Partnership Steering Committee Notes

THURSDAY, October 13, 2016

9 a.m. – 3:30 p.m.

Apache Gold Casino Conference Center
San Carlos, Arizona

MEETING PURPOSE:

- Review proposed partnership logo
- Review Issue Resolution Ladder
- Review Partnering Evaluation Program (PEP) Results
- Update Partnership Goals
- Discuss next meeting
- Provide partnership activity updates



ATTENDEES

Andre Stevens, WMAT Transit
Angelo Belvado, SCAT Transit
Bernadette Kniffin, SCAT Transit
Bill Harmon, ADOT
Cedar Polk, SCAT Department of Planning
Charlene Mullis, ADOT
Charles Russell, SCAT DOT
Danny Shurter, Navajo County
David Francis, SCAT Transit
David Thompson, SCAT DOT
Don Sneed, ADOT
Georgia Puente Meza, BIA – Fort Apache
Glenn Kephart, Navajo County Public Works
Kathy Borquez, Pinal County Public Works
Hanson Mull, SCAT Transportation – Cutler Airport
Haylon Dude, SCAT Department of Planning
John Marcanti, Gila County
Kurt Schmidt, SCAT Gaming Enterprise

ATTENDEES CONTINUED

Mary Tapija, SCAT DOT
Nate Nash, SCAT Department of Planning
Pat McBrayer, SCAT Transit
Rick Powers, Jacobs Engineering, Inc.
Sharon Gordon, FHWA
Steve Aday, BIA – San Carlos Agency
Tara Chief, WMAT DOT
Travis Ashbaugh, Central Arizona Governments (CAG)
Wilbur Belvado, SCAT Transit

FACILITATOR

Linda Ritter

WELCOME

Linda Ritter welcomed everyone and introduced ADOT Partnering Office Administrator, Bonnie Opie. Linda thanked SCAT DOT and SCAT Nnee Bich’o Nii Transit for providing lunch and refreshments for the meeting. Mary Tapija, SCAT DOT, gave the opening invocation. Charles Russell, Deputy Director of SCAT DOT, welcomed members of the Steering Committee. The participants then introduced themselves and stated what they hoped to accomplish by attending the meeting.

REVIEW OF PARTNERSHIP LOGO

- **Background:** The new logo for review was designed from the April and July Steering Committee meeting discussions, with agreement at the April meeting to have desert graphics representing the San Carlos Apache Tribe landscapes on one side of the logo and mountain graphics representing the White Mountain Apache Tribe landscapes on the other side of the logo, with a road in the logo’s center representing the transportation partnership.

In July, members reviewed a new logo mockup and agreed that more ground greenery and another pine tree on the right side of the logo would better represent the forest and greenery of the White Mountains, and a roadrunner on the left side should represent SCAT Transit. Also in July, discussion regarding the new logo included how best to include all Steering Committee agency names or logos with the new Partnership logo.

- In October, new logo mockups were reviewed that included elements from the discussion in July. From that review, it was agreed that the new logo should include green (not brown) snow-capped mountains on the right side of the logo, representing the White Mountains. Additionally, the font in “Transportation Partnership” needs to be consistent, and the WMAT logo needs to be included among the 12 logos or agency names.
- Also, it was agreed that a mockup with all agency names surrounding the new logo will be reviewed at the next meeting. Travis Ashbaugh, Transportation Planning Manager with Central Arizona Governments, volunteered to draft a mockup of this proposed design. The mockup will be provided to

the ADOT Graphic Team for development and will be available for review at the next Steering Committee meeting on January 25, 2017

ISSUE RESOLUTION LADDER

- The name “Issue Escalation Ladder” has been changed to “Issue Resolution Ladder” to represent how the ladder serves to work toward resolutions for a good partnership. A new ladder column for each tribe has been added for police as well as for BIA.
- Linda Ritter noted that there are a number of names/contact information that need to be added on the ladder. The ladder should be reviewed by agencies for any needed updates, and the update information provided to Linda via email.
- The ladder will be presented for brief review at all Steering Committee meetings, as its accuracy is important should any issues or emergencies arise.

PARTNERING EVALUATION PROGRAM (PEP)

- **Background:** There were 20 Steering Committee members who filled out PEP forms at the July 27, 2016 meeting. PEP serves to evaluate how well the partnership is progressing through members’ responses on the PEP form. It assists in determining areas needing improvement or areas in which the partnership is excelling. PEP is a numerically rated process, as well as an opportunity for members to provide comments about the partnership, regarding quality, communication, resolution, teamwork and relationships and schedule.
- PEP forms were filled out at the July meeting with the intent of sharing the information at the 2016 annual meeting (which was canceled). It will be up to the team to determine when they wish to next fill out the PEP forms.
- Bill Harmon spoke about the need to look at scores less than 3 and find ways to improve based on the comments for those scores.
- **Results:** Many comments were received, and they reflected well on the ongoing value the partnership is providing to the tribes and the agencies. Members provided scores on a scale of 1 (lowest) to 4 (highest):
 - **Quality – 3.17**
 - **Communication – 3.19**
 - **Issue Resolution – 3.21**
 - **Teamwork and Relationships – 3.35**
 - **Schedule – 3.35**

GOALS/ACTION STEPS REPORT

- Director of Nnee Bich’o Nii Transit Services, Bernadette Kniffin, provided a presentation of Transit achievements.

- The Goals/Action Steps report was reviewed and action items were added. Achieved Goals are noted at the end of the document.
- The report is updated and posted on the AZ Tribal Transportation website:
<http://www.aztribaltransportation.org/sca/index.asp>
- The Steering Committee will update and document the goals that have been achieved at each Steering Committee meeting and develop new goals (with assistance at the annual meeting from leadership), once existing goals are achieved.

ANNUAL MEETING AND FUTURE STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS

- **Background:** At the July 27, 2016 Steering Committee meeting, it was determined to hold off the Annual Meeting until the following year- October 19, 2017. It was agreed that action items surrounding the Goals Plan still need to be completed before another Annual Meeting should be held. The Goals/Action Steps report documents two years of efforts. The Annual Meeting in October 2015 discussed/reported what had been accomplished to that date, but there is not yet a good amount of completed action items to report this year. It is anticipated that key goals/action items will be completed over the next year. The achievements can be reported at the 2017 Annual Meeting and potential new goals/action items can be discussed at that time.
- Bill Harmon summarized that reporting at the Annual Meeting will be about two types of accomplishments - Project Delivery and Process Improvements. Process improvements are a focal point of the Steering Committee's Goals/Implementation Plan.
- The Steering Committee **will meet again on January 25, 2017 at Apache Gold Casino Conference Center**. Additional Steering Committee meeting dates for 2017 will be determined at that meeting.
- The meeting time will be shortened and will be held from **10 a.m. to 2 p.m.** to accommodate members' busy schedules. It was agreed that the lunch hour provides a great time for networking.

ROUNDTABLE – PARTNER UPDATES

- **Charlene Mullis** - ADOT is continuing to work with SCAT DOT on the US 70 Bylas project and is looking forward to a successful completion. There will be a presentation regarding the project on October 18th at the transportation committee meeting.
- **Don Sneed** - ADOT provided an internal email to all employees regarding an update to the ADOT Tribal Consultation Policy in September. Links were updated and the major changes reflect the current business practices of ADOT. Definitions of consultation, coordination and cooperation were updated. The ADOT Government Relations office suggested the revisions. The policy is online at aztribaltransportation.org. It will be reviewed and updated every two years.
- **Don Sneed** - ADOT is working with tribes to assist in updating long-range transportation plans by providing the information needed for tribes to determine next steps and get projects underway. There were six informational workshops held across the state with specific tribes on "Integrating Statewide and Tribal Transportation Planning." CD's of the workshop will be distributed to all of the ADOT tribal transportation contacts and posted to the ADOT website. ADOT is also considering doing an approximate two-hour webinar to make this information widely available.

- **Bill Harmon** - ADOT projects:
 - Just wrapped up a chip seal project on a portion of BIA 6.
 - An intersection improvement project on southern BIA 6 is scheduled late next year.
 - SR 70 Bylas is a large safety project primarily funded with HSIP, but there is also other funding in the mix. The project will include a Pedestrian Hybrid Beacon (PHB), which is a traffic control device used to stop road traffic and allow pedestrians to cross safely. It will also include a raised median, curb and gutter, sidewalk, pathway improvements, pavement markers, pedestrian fence gaps next to cattle guards, lighting, etc. The project is expected to be advertised in late spring 2017 and be under construction in the summer. The railroad will also be doing improvements.
 - A spot intersection improvements project on US 70, on the west side over to the old road to Roosevelt Lake, is being submitted for consideration, but is not yet approved.
- **Bill Harmon** - Per the Governor's direction, ADOT is going through organization changes with reduced staffing, which addresses a philosophical change regarding how we do business and embrace continuous improvement in a lean manner.
- **Bill Harmon** - If you need to contact Bill with an urgent matter, please call or text him, as he may not be available to respond quickly to an email.
- **Tara Chief** - WMAT DOT is involved with various transportation projects:
 - This includes a canyon frontage road project.
 - ADOT is starting a design project for a pedestrian crossing on 73.
 - WMAT DOT is working with Navajo County on BIA 12, the road to Cibecue.
 - The biggest focus for WMAT DOT is getting transit up and running.
- **Glenn Kephart** - Navajo County Public Works meets regularly with WMAT. Effectively maintaining Cibicue Route 12 is frustrating, due to jurisdictional issues – part of Route 12 is in Gila County and the other in Navajo County. The department is working on partnering through an IGA with BIA, Gila County and WMAT to fix an area outside Navajo County jurisdiction. Gila County wants a different type of agreement than the IGA requested, and this is making it difficult to get the necessary road work achieved. Partnership members will think of ways to help and contact Tara Chief.
- **Bill Harmon** - Public safety in the Salt River Canyon: Question if there is any cultural reason or any other reason among the two tribes that would prevent radio towers from being installed in the canyon to help with communications among DPS and other emergency responders. Mary Tapija and Tara Chief both felt it would be acceptable to install the towers with the exception of the salt banks (where Cibicue Creek meets the Salt River).
- **Mary Tapija** – SCAT DOT: There are 1.8 miles of SCAT Route 6 paperwork moving forward. The tentative start date is the first part of November and funding is through BIA - using BIA specs.
- **Kathy Borquez** – Pinal County is currently assisting with Apache Sky Casino roadway quality assurance inspections.

- **Travis Ashbaugh** – The Central Arizona Association of Governments transit study RFP went out last week. The CAG Greater Gila County Transit Implementation Plan will have a huge role in providing for future interconnectivity in the region.

The Steering Committee meeting concluded with a closing prayer by Travis Ashbaugh.

NEXT MEETING AGENDA

The next Steering Committee meeting on January 25, 2017 at Apache Gold Casino will include:

- “What’s on your mind?”
- 9-1-1 Emergency Response presentation by ADOT GIS Program Manager, James Meyer, and ADOA 9-1-1 Project Manager, Sandra Dyre
- Logo review and finalization
- Issue Resolution Ladder review
- Goals/Action items update
- Planning for future meetings

ACTION ITEM TO BE COMPLETED BY STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRIOR TO THE OCTOBER 13, 2016 MEETING

- Be sure to review the Issue Resolution Ladder for your agency and provide Linda with any updated information.

SUMMARY OF PARTICIPANT MEETING EVALUATION

Scores are based on 10 evaluations. Comments are taken from the evaluation forms exactly as written.

1. Rate how valuable this workshop is for you. 4.4 out of 5

What about this workshop was most valuable to you?

- Transit partnership.
- Coordinating with participants; understanding their issues.
- Creating and maintaining working relationships.
- Understanding the needs of SCAT and WMAT to help contribute solutions. Getting together for discussion is always valuable.
- Being able to partner with different agencies; find out what projects are on the table.
- I find value in the opportunity to discuss common transportation challenges and successes. I truly enjoyed Bernadette’s presentation and hearing the successful stories.
- Updates to Goals Implementation Plans

2. What would have improved this workshop?

- Good participation in the morning, but not everyone was able to stay to the end.
- More participation from one tribe.
- I don’t have any suggestions/ideas to improve the meeting.
- Maybe more participation from the tribal council members.
- Shorter times. Not sure if 6.5 hours is needed.
- Tribal Council has the ultimate authority to make commitments; it would be a big improvement to have their presence.

- None – was good.
- Agreed – let's try making the meeting a little shorter.
- Make a little shorter.

3. How do you rate the facilitator? 4.4 out of 5

- Great job Linda.
- Good job.
- I believe Linda is a great facilitator and keeps the meeting and dialogue moving forward. She listens and makes suggestions when appropriate.
- Linda worked to keep the meeting moving and on track.
- Overall great. A few occasions when felt as if we got off topic.
- Class act – thanks!
- Great job!!

4. How do you rate the effectiveness of the team? 4.4 out of 5

- Good participation shows commitment to be effective.
- Very effective. Always got my questions answered.
- I have seen progress made on the goals and it appears to me that more partners are speaking up and expressing their ideas.
- Members gave good reports and updates on projects. 911 progress.
- Only have attended a few meetings, but overall it appears to be effective. Everyone is committed to achieving common goals.
- Great potential and motivations.

5. What other comments or suggestions do you have?

- I don't have any other comments to share at this time.
- I liked the comment that Tara made on the committee for WMAT that works together on transportation problems.
- Just slightly shorter times.
- Great participation from everyone with updates on projects and sharing success stories like transit.
- Most of the questions from Realty. Someone from the Realty Department should be present to answer some of the questions.
- None at this time.